



DOUGLAS A. DUCEY
- GOVERNOR -

VICTORIA WHITMORE
- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -

ARIZONA STATE VETERINARY MEDICAL EXAMINING BOARD

1740 W. ADAMS ST., STE. 4600 ♦ PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

PHONE: (602) 364-1-PET ♦ FAX: (602) 364-1039

VETBOARD.AZ.GOV

MINUTES

May 16, 2018

Board Room A, at 8:30 a.m.
1740 W. Adams Street, Board Room A
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Members Present: Mr. Jim Loughead, Dr. Sarah Heinrich, Dr. Christina Bertch-Mumaw, Dr. Robyn Jaynes, Ms. Jessica Creager (left at 2:00pm), Dr. J. Greg Byrne, Ms. Nikki Frost, CVT, Dr. Darren Wright and Ms. Julie Young.

Staff and Legal Counsel Present: Ms. Sunita Krishna, Assistant Attorney General (AAG) (left at 12:15 p.m.); Marc Harris, Assistant Attorney General (AAG) (arrived at 12:15 p.m.); Kodi Calais, Licensing Administrator and Ms. Tracy Riendeau, CVT, Senior Medical Investigator.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Roll call: Dr. Bertch-Mumaw at 8:33 a.m.

II. INITIAL INVESTIGATIVE REVIEW

1. 18-48, In Re: Greg Heitman, DVM

Dr. Heitman was present with attorney David Stoll and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Jaynes and seconded by Dr. Wright to **disagree** with the Investigative Committee's recommendation and dismiss this issue with no violation but issue a **Letter of Concern** with respect to medical record documentation, specifically the type of IV fluids administered to the dog as well as ensuring there is better clarification on the anesthesia monitoring form regarding the rate of IV fluids administered and overall monitoring of the animal. Motion passed unanimously.

2. 18-49, In Re: Jeffrey Steurer, DVM

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Ms. Creager to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

3. 18-50, In Re: Bradford Dixon, DVM

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Ms. Creager to accept the

Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

4. 18-51, In Re: Carmen Perez, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to accept the Investigative Committee's findings and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

5. 18-52, In Re: Alison Ariano, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to offer Dr. Ariano a **Consent Agreement**, adopting the proposed Findings of Fact as the Board's Findings of Fact, and amending the Conclusions of Law, finding only the medical record keeping violation. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 nay (Dr. Jaynes).

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw for the Consent Agreement to include a period of **Probation for 1-year** to obtain **6 hours of continuing education**, in addition to the statutory requirements to maintain licensure, in **medical record keeping**. The Consent Agreement shall also include a **civil penalty of \$500** to be paid on or before the end of the Probationary period. Roll call: Dr. Byrne, aye; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to issue Dr. Ariano a **Letter of Concern** with respect to using current formularies as guidance when dosing medications. Motion passed unanimously.

6. 18-53, In Re: Christina Innocenti, DVM

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

7. 18-54, In Re: Kellie Barrett, DVM

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Jaynes and seconded by Ms. Creager to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

8. 18-55, In Re: Todd Metcalf, DVM

Dr. Metcalf was present with attorney David Stoll and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Wright to **disagree** with the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

9. 18-58, In Re: Donald Rollins, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

10. 18-99, In Re: Glenda Davis, CVT

Mr. Loughead was recused. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Byrne and seconded by Ms. Creager to **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 recusal.

11. 18-101, In Re: Hugo Santibanez, DVM

Dr. Santibanez was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Young and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to offer Dr. Santibanez a **Consent Agreement** adopting the proposed Findings of Fact as the Board's Findings of Fact and cite **A.R.S. § 32-2232 (18)** for violating Board Order 17-97 as the Conclusions of Law. Roll call: Dr. Byrne, aye; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Young and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw for the Consent Agreement to include a **civil penalty of \$500** to be paid within 30 days after the effective date of the Consent Agreement. Roll call: Dr. Byrne, aye; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

III. INFORMAL INTERVIEWS AND BOARD DELIBERATION

1. 18-41: In Re: Monika Knoblich, DVM

Ms. Creager was absent. Dr. Knoblich was present with counsel, David Stoll, and made statements and answered questions. Mr. Ron Sirota was present, made statements and answered questions. Ms. Trina MacPhail was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Jaynes and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to find Dr. Knoblich in violation of:

- **A.R.S. § 32-2232 (12)** as it relates to **A.A.C. R3-11-501 (1)** failure to provide professionally acceptable procedures for not properly interpreting radiographs - failed to identify a deformity - or seek specialty resources to get a proper diagnoses if Respondent did not feel comfortable interpreting the radiographs.

Roll call: Dr. Byrne, nay; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, recused; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Bertch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed 7 ayes, 1 nay, and 1 absent.

2. 18-35: In Re: Kenneth Halbach, DVM

Dr. Halbach was present telephonically, counsel, David Stoll was present; both made statements and answered questions. Ms. Tiffany Jennings was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost to find Dr. Halbach in violation of:

- **A.R.S. § 32-2232 (12)** as it relates to **A.A.C. R3-11-501 (1)** failure to provide professionally acceptable procedures with respect to CPR administration and management as well as failing to communicate the results of the blood work to the pet owner.

No second, motion failed.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Ms. Young to find Dr. Halbach in violation of:

- A.R.. § 32-2232 (12) as it relates to A.A.C. R3-11-501 (1) failure to provide professionally acceptable procedures for not communicating with the pet owner the interpretation of the blood work.

Roll call: Dr. Byrne, aye; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Betch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, aye, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed unanimously.

After further discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Dr. Wright to issue Dr. Halbach a **Letter of Concern** with respect to anesthesia induction and CPR protocols and documentation in medical record. **Motion failed – 4 ayes, 5 nays.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to find Dr. Halbach in violation of:

- A.R.S. § 32-2232 (12) as it relates to A.A.C. R3-11-501 (1) failure to provide professionally acceptable procedures and use current professional and scientific knowledge for using outdated anesthetic protocol of atropine and acepromazine followed by mask induction when other viable options are available to avoid undue stress on the patient.

Roll call: Dr. Byrne, nay; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Betch-Mumaw, nay; Mr. Loughead, nay, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed 6 ayes, 3 nays.

3. 18-47: In Re: Adriana Stinnett, DVM

Dr. Stinnett was present with counsel, David Stoll, and made statements and answered questions. Mr. Daniel Kuret was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to find Dr. Stinnett in violation of:

- A.R.S. § 32-2232 (12) as it relates to A.A.C. R3-11-501 (1) failure to provide professionally acceptable procedures for misinterpretation of radiographs and missing a blockage pattern.

Roll call: Dr. Byrne, aye; Ms. Young, aye; Ms. Frost, aye; Ms. Creager, aye; Dr. Wright, aye; Dr. Betch-Mumaw, aye; Mr. Loughead, nay, Dr. Heinrich, aye; and Dr. Jaynes, aye. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 nay.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF PREVIOUS ACTIONS

1.14-27: In Re: Monica Bunge, DVM. Quarterly appearance as required by Consent Agreement. Board may review, discuss, and take action to modify terms of Consent Agreement.

Dr. Bunge did not appear. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Young and seconded by Dr. Betch-Mumaw to table this matter to the next Board meeting and direct staff to attempt to contact Dr. Bunge. Motion passed unanimously.

2. 18-17: In Re: Ivan Weinstein, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education plan and course descriptions submitted as required by Board Order.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Jaynes to approve Dr. Weinstein's continuing education plan submitted in compliance with his Board Order. Motion passed unanimously.

3. 18-16 and 18-18: In Re: Edwin Kiesel, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on partial Continuing Education plan submitted in compliance with Board Order.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Wright to approve Dr. Kiesel's partial continuing education plan submitted in compliance with his Board Order. Motion passed unanimously.

4. 17-68: In Re: Emily Clinton, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on completion of Continuing Education as required by Board Order and may return license to Active status.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to accept Dr. Clinton's completion of continuing education as required by her Board Order and return her license to Active status. Motion passed unanimously.

5. 17-97: In Re: Hugo Santibanez, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education plan submitted in compliance with Consent Agreement and may approve Continuing Education completed as required.

Dr. Santibanez was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the continuing education plan submitted in compliance with his Consent Agreement. Motion passed unanimously. There was no review of completed continuing education!

V. REPORTS, CORRESPONDENCE, REFERRALS AND OTHER BUSINESS

1. Board may review, discuss, and take action on complaint received regarding lay person.
Item removed from agenda.

2. Board may review, discuss, and take action on request for Temporary Permit pending receipt of affidavit and proof of graduation.

- a. Madelyn Melchior
- b. Jessica Schneider
- c. Aslyn Brandt
- d. Marston Jones
- e. Courtney Pike

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the above requests for Temporary Permit pending receipt of affidavit and proof of graduation. Motion passed unanimously.

3. Board may review, discuss, and take action on veterinary technician certification pending receipt of certificate fee.

- a. Valerie Dupont
- b. Stephanie Elswick
- c. Stephanie Garcia
- d. Lacey Markham
- e. Alice McArthur

- f. Griselda Monteros
- g. Emily Motzkin
- h. Mariah Spicer
- i. Francisco Torres
- j. Stephanie Young
- k. Jennifer White

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the above veterinary technician certifications pending receipt of certificate issuance fee. Motion passed unanimously.

4. Board may interview Investigative Committee member applicants and may discuss and take action to appoint committee members.

- a. William Hamilton

Mr. Hamilton was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Wright to appoint Mr. Hamilton to the afternoon Investigative Committee. Motion passed unanimously.

- b. Carolyn Ratajackson

Will appear before the Board in June.

5. Board may review, discuss, and take action on veterinary license pending receipt of proof of graduation and license fee.

- a. Michael Barchilon
- b. Lydi Bolduc
- c. Ashley Chirco
- d. Julianne Daggett
- e. Jessica Darmofal
- f. Mariam Durkin
- g. Courtney Ells
- h. Aurrielle Eberhardy
- i. Rachel Engard
- j. Christina Garza
- k. Jackelyn Hare
- l. Stephanie Harris
- m. Alex Hawthorn
- n. Kiefer Hazard
- o. Elizabeth Hyde
- p. Devon Kartchner
- q. Samuel Kirby
- r. Brian Krisko
- s. Marielle LeFloc'h
- t. Kellianne Minarik
- u. Robert Newman
- v. Peter O'Neal
- w. Meera Ramesh
- x. Adam Riley
- y. Garrett Rowley
- z. Samantha Rudolph

- aa. Barbara Scheiding**
- bb. Danielle Semick**
- cc. Kate Shoemaker**
- dd. Madison Skelton**
- ee. Lane Smith**
- ff. Erin Tragesser**
- gg. Benjamin Ulrich**
- hh. Alexa Wilson**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the above veterinary licenses pending proof of graduation and receipt of issuance fee. Motion passed unanimously.

6. Board may review, discuss, and take action on denial of certified veterinary technician certificate, if applicable. (List available upon request.)

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw and seconded by Ms. Creager to deny the veterinary technician applicants that have failed the VTNE and/or State exam and appoint Ms. Whitmore to represent the Board if a settlement conference is requested, with her authority limited to denial. Motion passed unanimously.

7. Board may review, discuss, and take action on veterinary application.

- a. Amy Sheil**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Dr. Wright to approve Dr. Sheil's veterinary application. Motion passed unanimously.

8. Board may review, discuss, and take action on veterinary application and request for temporary permit.

- a. Kara McArdell**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve Dr. McArdell's veterinary application and temporary permit. Motion passed unanimously.

9. Board may review, discuss, and take action on complaints received that may not be within the Board's jurisdiction.

Item removed from agenda.

10. Board may review, discuss and take action on topic of unlabeled filled syringes on hand at vaccination clinics.

Ms. Creager was absent. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to open an investigation with respect to the responsible veterinarian at the vaccination clinics that are pre-filling vaccine syringes. Motion passed 8 ayes, 1 absent.

VI. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. April 18, 2018 Regular Session

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the April 18, 2018 regular session minutes. Motion passed unanimously.

b. April 18, 2018 Executive Session

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Wright to approve the April 18, 2018 executive session minutes. Motion passed unanimously.

VII. CONSENT AGENDA

A. Approval to take State Veterinary Exam

1. Bryla, Tiffany (R)
2. Casida, Ashley (R)
3. Cooper, Rebecca (R)
4. Crowe, Leeann (R)
5. Hymes, Mercedes (R)
6. Hynes, John (E)
7. Huth, Kelly (R)
8. Jones, Marston (R)
9. Laver, Travis (S)
10. Leber, Amanda (R)
11. McDaniel, Lydia (R)
12. Melchiors, Madelyn (R)
13. Mikhaleva, Natalia (R)
14. Wayt, Helena (R)
15. Williams, Jarred (E)
16. Young, Serena (E)
17. Brandt, Aslyn (R)
18. Chicotka, Katherine (R)
19. Feldman, Tracie (R)
20. Lindley, Stephanie (E)
21. Linehan, Chelsea (R)
22. McCoy, Taylor (R)
23. Miller, Whitney (E)
24. Monson, Treven (R)
25. Parker, Lance (R)
26. Pike, Courtney (R)
27. Schneider, Jessica (R)

Approval to take State Veterinary Exam granted.

B. Approval to take Veterinary Technician Exam(s)

1. Costa, Amy
2. Cunningham, Nicholas
3. Arizmendi, Acacia
4. LeMieux, Charlotte
5. Sims, Charlotte

Approval to take Veterinary Technician Exam(s) granted.

C. Approval of Premise Licenses

1. R3047: Arizona Humane Society Second Chance Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
2. R3048: Arizona Humane Society Healthy Tails Mobile Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
3. R3049: Arizona Humane Society Margaret McAllister Brock Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
4. R3050: Arizona Humane Society Marge Wright Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
5. R3051: Serenity In Home Pet Euthanasia, PLLC. New Premise. Ryan Pearce, DVM.
6. R3052: Bark Avenue Animal Hospital. New Owner/New Responsible Veterinarian. Ryan Ainsworth, DVM
7. R3053: Westside Veterinary Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Jennifer Siess, DVM
8. R3054: Pet Dental USA, PLLC. New Premise. Jenifer Redmon, DVM
9. R3055: Desert Ark Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Wendy Hancock, DVM
10. R3056: Rescue Vet Services. New Premise. Leo Egar, DVM
11. R3057: Maricopa County Animal Care & Control – West Shelter. New Responsible Veterinarian. Leo Egar, DVM
12. R3058: Maricopa County Animal Care & Control – East Shelter. New Responsible Veterinarian. Leo Egar, DVM
13. R3059: Las Sendas Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Amanda Liesse, DVM
14. R3060: Dobson Ranch Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Brigid Hirth, DVM

**C (1), (2), (3), (4), (7), (8), (9), (10), (11), (12), and (14) removed from Consent Agenda.
Approval of Premise Licenses granted.**

D. Approval of Temporary Permit(s)

1. Williams, Jarred
 2. Parker, Lance
- Approval of Temporary Permit granted.**

E. Approval of Faculty Member License

1. Cornell, Heather
- Approval of Faculty Member License granted.**

F. Approval of Technician Reinstatement for Certification

1. Soldin, Heather
- Approval of Technician Reinstatement for Certification granted.**

G. Approval of Veterinary License

1. Lisa Fink (E)
- Approval of Veterinary License granted.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Bertch-Mumaw to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion passed unanimously.

Items Removed From Consent Agenda

- C (1) R3047: Arizona Humane Society Second Chance Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
C (2) R3048: Arizona Humane Society Healthy Tails Mobile Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
C (3) R3049: Arizona Humane Society Margaret McAllister Brock Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
C (4) R3050: Arizona Humane Society Marge Wright Veterinary Clinic. New Responsible Veterinarian. Steven Hansen, DVM
C (7) R3053: Westside Veterinary Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Jennifer Siess, DVM
C (8) R3054: Pet Dental USA, PLLC. New Premise. Jenifer Redmon, DVM
C (9) R3055: Desert Ark Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Wendy Hancock, DVM
C (10) R3056: Rescue Vet Services. New Premise. Leo Egar, DVM
C (11) R3057: Maricopa County Animal Care & Control – West Shelter. New Responsible Veterinarian. Leo Egar, DVM
C (12) R3058: Maricopa County Animal Care & Control – East Shelter. New Responsible Veterinarian. Leo Egar, DVM
C (14) R3060: Dobson Ranch Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Brigid Hirth, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Dr. Betch-Mumaw to approve the above premises pending inspection and compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

VIII. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

No summary of current events.

IX. CALL TO PUBLIC

No member of the public wished to speak.

X. ESTABLISHMENT OF FUTURE MEETING DATE

The next regular meeting will be held on **Wednesday, June 20, 2018** beginning at 8:30 a.m. at 1740 W. Adams St., Board Room A, Phoenix, Arizona 85007.

XI. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 2:06 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,


Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director